

Tuesday, 9 November 2021

TORBAY RACISM REVIEW PANEL

A meeting of **Torbay Racism Review Panel** will be held on

Wednesday, 17 November 2021

commencing at **6.00 pm**

The meeting will be held in via Zoom Meeting - Virtual (meeting joining details can be found on the agenda frontsheet or agenda reports pack)

Join Zoom Meeting

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82725367191?pwd=SCtsck5mcDlpOHZ2OCtScUJpblJMdz09>

Meeting ID: 827 2536 7191

Passcode: 444226

Dial by your location

+44 203 481 5240 United Kingdom

+44 203 901 7895 United Kingdom

Members of the Committee

Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chairman)

Councillor Barrand
Councillor Steve Darling
Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo
Maia Thomas

Councillor John Thomas (Vice-Chair)
Councillor Loxton
Kevin Dixon
Rehan Uddin

A prosperous and healthy Torbay

Download this agenda via the free modern.gov app on your [iPad](#), [Android Device](#) or [Blackberry Playbook](#). For information relating to this meeting or to request a copy in another format or language please contact:
, Town Hall, Castle Circus, Torquay, TQ1 3DR

Email: governance.support@torbay.gov.uk - www.torbay.gov.uk

TORBAY RACISM REVIEW PANEL AGENDA

1. **Apologies**
2. **Action Notes from panel meetings on 18th August 2021 and 8th November 2021** (Pages 4 - 10)

3. **Declarations of interests**

- (a) To receive declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests in respect of items on this agenda

For reference: Where a Member has a disclosable pecuniary interest he/she must leave the meeting during consideration of the item. However, the Member may remain in the meeting to make representations, answer questions or give evidence if the public have a right to do so, but having done so the Member must then immediately leave the meeting, may not vote and must not improperly seek to influence the outcome of the matter. A completed disclosure of interests form should be returned to the Clerk before the conclusion of the meeting.

(Please Note: If Members and Officers wish to seek advice on any potential interests they may have, they should contact Governance Support or Legal Services prior to the meeting.)

- (b) To receive declarations of non pecuniary interests in respect of items on this agenda

For reference: Having declared their non pecuniary interest members may remain in the meeting and speak and, vote on the matter in question. A completed disclosure of interests form should be returned to the Clerk before the conclusion of the meeting.

4. **Question and answer session with Andrew George from the National Black Police Association.**

5. **AOB**

Members of the public wishing to ask a question of the panel or attendees are requested to register in advance of the meeting.

The panel Chair invites members of the public to ask questions of the review panel for two minutes. Please register in advance by emailing your question to: equality@torbay.gov.uk.

Instructions for the Press and Public for joining the meeting

If you are using an iPad you will need to install Zoom which can be found in the App Store. You do not need to register for an account just install the software. You only need to install the software once. For other devices you should just be taken direct to the meeting.

Joining a Meeting

Click on the link provided on the agenda above and follow the instructions on screen. If you are using a telephone, dial the Zoom number provided above and follow the instructions. (**Note:** if you are using a landline the call will cost up to 13p per minute and from a mobile between 3p and 55p if the number is not covered by your inclusive minutes.)

You will be placed in a waiting room, when the meeting starts the meeting Host will admit you. Please note if there are technical issues this might not be at the start time given on the agenda.

Upon entry you will be muted and your video switched off so that only the meeting participants can be seen. When you join the meeting the Host will unmute your microphone, ask you to confirm your name and update your name as either public or press. Select gallery view if you want to see all the participants.

If you have joined the meeting via telephone, your telephone number will appear on screen and will be displayed for all to see until the Host has confirmed your name and then they will rename your telephone number to either public or press.

Meeting Etiquette - things to consider when attending a virtual meeting

- Background – the meeting is public and people will be able to see what is behind you therefore consider what you will have on display behind you.
- Camera angle – sit front on, upright with the device in front of you.
- Who else is in the room – make sure you are in a position where nobody will enter the camera shot who doesn't want to appear in the public meeting.
- Background noise – try where possible to minimise background noise.
- Aim to join the meeting 15 minutes before it is due to start.

TORBAY COUNCIL

Torbay Racism Review Panel

Review Panel Notes

Wednesday 18 August 2021

Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Steve Darling, Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo, and Kevin Dixon.

Also Present: Jane Milligan, CEO Devon CCG and Integrated Care System (ICS) for Devon, Andrew Millward, Director of Communications and Engagement of ICS Devon; and Director of Communications, HR and IT, Devon CCG, Nellie Guttmann, Senior Strategic Engagement Manager, Devon CCG and Lincoln Sargeant, Director of Public Health, Torbay Council and Chair of Devon Health Inequalities Executive.

Apologies: Councillor John Thomas, Maia Thomas and Rehan Uddin.

Other Councillors Present: Councillor Brooks and Councillor Douglas-Dunbar.

Pecuniary Interests: None declared.

Previous Meeting Notes: The notes of the meeting held by the panel on 3 August 2021 were agreed as a correct record.

1.Presentation of Nous Report on Experiences of Health and Care in Devon for BAME Communities and Staff

The CCG representatives gave a presentation on the outcomes and recommendations made in the Nous report. The work to inform the report was undertaken in September 2020-April 2021 by NHS and Local Authority organisations in Devon and sought to review the experiences of the diverse communities and staff across Devon, including Torbay.

The report made 34 recommendations and these will inform the equality, diversity and inclusion strategy for the new Integrated Care System (ICS).

In relation to staff feedback the main themes of the report were:

- Concerns from BAME staff about recruitment, progression and ethnic diversity in their organisation
- Staff experiences of racism, which though rare do occur and are not always dealt with effectively by their organisation
- Staff view that equality and diversity is not a priority for their organisation
- Staff concerns about a lack of BAME staff networks and their sustainability.

In relation to community feedback the main themes of the report were:

- Inadequate interpretation and translation support which causes barriers

- Perceived lack of cultural competence among providers
- Concerns about mental health and isolation due to challenges in accessing services.

In essence the 34 recommendations focus on:

- Developing community reference group/s to represent the views of diverse communities across Devon
- Supporting the development of the system BAME staff network
- Co-designing and delivering cultural awareness training for staff in all organisations across the ICS
- Co-designing services including translation and interpretation
- Overhauling recruitment and progression to build a more diverse workforce that represents local ethnic minority communities across the ICS in Devon
- Building stronger relationships with communities to ensure health services meet the needs of people from ethnic minority communities

The CCG explained that progress is already being made by the ICS on the issues identified in the report by:

- Increasing support and collaboration with the BAME staff network
- Working to ensure Devon is a welcoming place to work for international nurses and medics
- Working to widen BAME representation via the voluntary and community sector
- Ensuring the recruitment process for ICS Devon chair is undertaken with representation from diverse communities
- Using Nous findings to inform the Covid vaccination outreach programme approach.

2. How do we make Black, Asian and Minority ethnic lives matter at Torbay's Public organisations – Questions to Devon CCG

The CCG representatives gave an overview of the organisation and made the following points in relation to the key question:

- CCG employs around 450 staff, around 100 are based in Torbay (Pomona House)
- BAME staff make up approximately 2.2% of the CCG's staff population
- Although unacceptably low, the number of ethnic minority staff within the CCG has been increasing over the past few years. For example, some departments in the organisation are improving more quickly (Comms, HR and IT is currently at 5.4%)
- There is a CCG Objective (measured at Board level) to move this closer to the Devon average of 6.4%

- CCG has been overseeing the vaccination programme. Through the outreach of this work, they are starting to build strong links with ethnic minority communities. Examples include:
 - Working with the Muslim community to deliver a vaccination pop up site at the Exeter Mosque
 - Working with Devon and Cornwall Chinese Association to vaccinate migrant workers and undocumented migrants
 - Vaccine ambassadors programme – Diverse Health and Social Care staff have been acting as champions to support the vaccine programme.
 - Facilitating question and answer sessions with community groups, including Christian Fellowship churches
 - A new Equality Diversity and Inclusion Group has been set up and linked to the Staff Partnership Forum to oversee the organisation's cultural development programme and the overhaul of recruitment

Panel members and others then asked a series of questions and the main points in relation to the responses from the CCG are detailed below:

- The ICS network will provide greater opportunities for staff, especially BAME staff to develop and gather greater experience and promotion across the network of ICS organisations
- Organisations in the ICS needed to see the appraisal process as less of a tick box exercise and more of an opportunity to develop staff, especially BAME staff
- More reverse mentoring is required across the ICS organisations to ensure BAME staff have the opportunities to grow and that senior leaders understand the issues facing their BAME staff
- More is required to be done to attract BAME people to work in Devon and that one of the key barriers is appropriate and affordable accommodation
- Tensions were identified between international recruitment of staff and de-skilling the workforce in their country of origin. However, more could be done to build partnerships with other countries to develop workforces that are beneficial to both countries
- Although international recruitment is helpful, there is still a huge untapped potential workforce from the UK, especially from a BAME background that could be utilised
- Data collection on racism in the NHS could be better and is stopping it from understanding the issues facing BAME staff and communities. One response to this would be peer challenge on equality and diversity issues from organisations within the ICS
- That whilst there are pockets of good practice across Devon, more needs to be done to tackle the disproportionate impact of mental health on BAME communities as a result of the Covid pandemic. This requires greater investment in cultural sensitivity training for key staff so people are encouraged to engage with services and are not put off. Essentially organisations need to

build trust with their BAME communities so that they feel confident to access services

- That cultural sensitivity training for ICS staff in Torbay was still in the process of being planned but would be implemented soon
- That the CCG had plans in place to deal with the impending arrival of refugees from Afghanistan who will require support from the NHS
- The CCG was confident that during the Covid pandemic NHS organisations in Devon had undertaken robust risk assessments of all staff (including staff from a BAME background) to protect them from infection
- Overall the CGG and ICS organisations are confident that they will achieve successful outcomes in relation to the 34 recommendations outlined in the Nous report and have invested more resources to deliver these actions. However, there is recognition that some would take longer to achieve than others. An action plan has been created to manage the recommendations but the future is more about embedding a new way of working rather than mechanically ticking off actions.

TORBAY COUNCIL

Torbay Racism Review Panel

Review Panel Notes

Monday 8 November 2021

Review Panel Attendees: Councillor Atiya-Alla (Chair), Councillor Barrand, Councillor Loxton, Councillor Douglas-Dunbar (substitute for Councillor Steve Darling), Maia Thomas and Kevin Dixon.

Also Present: Laurence Frewin, Principal and CEO, South Devon College, Liz Lawrence, Assistant Principal, South Devon College and Kelly Sooben, Vice-Principal, South Devon College.

Other Councillors Present: Councillor Law

Apologies: Councillor Steve Darling, Councillor John Thomas, Kofi Yeboah-Aidoo and Rehan Uddin.

Pecuniary Interests: None declared.

The panel asked a range of questions to the representatives from South Devon College and the key points that came out of the questioning were:

- The college supports BAME students via its tutorial system and via a personal development programme which focuses on citizenship and equality and diversity. The college also does a lot to promote Black History Month, has an International Club, a country of the week and a focus on current affairs issues. The college did a lot on the Black Lives Matter issue and celebrates events such as Diwali at the College and offers cultural trips for students.
- The college has an Equality Working Group that focuses on all protected characteristics and meets regularly to review the experiences of BAME learners but the college does acknowledge that it could do more
- The college measures the success of these initiatives via the student voice and listens to students. The Senior Leadership Team meets once a month to review equality and diversity issues and to identify issues and gaps. In relation to staff that leave, exit interviews are held to determine any issues and the same is done with learners who leave South Devon College
- The college has a buoyant take up from adult students who have english as a second language
- The panel questioned whether students felt safe to voice concerns on race issues. The college explained that they have a system in place that allows students to raise issues anonymously or they can raise issues via the tutorial system with their tutor. Other mechanisms are also available such as student councils and specific groups such as young carers

- Staff can voice concerns via the robust policies in place via their manager or HR team and the college regularly reviews these policies to ensure they are best practice
- The college stated that in relation to race the culture of the college was explicit. This was backed up by its statement in response to George Floyd's death in May 2020
- The panel asked about racist incidents at the college and the college stated that they were not seeing high levels of reporting but they are aware that there could be underreporting of incidents. However, the college did state that over the last 12 months they had no racist incidents with staff
- The panel questioned whether the college had measurable objectives on racial equality and they responded by stating that they had more work to do on this and that it was still work in progress. They explained that they wanted to do more work with BAME staff and learners to explore what the right actions and measures could be
- A member of the public asked the college what work they did with families of learners to address racism. The college stated that they already did lots of general work with parents and families but often found it difficult to engage with them and that they could do more to engage with BAME families specifically to support them and their children
- The college explained that all new staff have mandatory equality and diversity training when they arrive at the college and then all staff have annual updates to keep them up to speed on best practice in this area. In addition, some staff such as those involved in the Prevent Agenda have specialist training
- The college considers that their strengths in relation to equality and diversity are listening to their learners, the strengths of the personal development programme, clear code of conduct for staff, robust Equality Impact Assessment process and low instances of racist incidents with staff
- The college considers its areas for development in equality and diversity to be; improved data tracking, better engagement with the local community to check they have the right actions in place, improving reporting processes to encourage learners and staff to report incidents, to increase number of BAME staff and learners, to work more closely with families and parents on equality and diversity, to work more closely with staff to find ways to remove or overcome barriers, to encourage BAME staff to come and work at the college and to highlight existing staff who can be role models for others
- The panel questioned whether a formal process for raising incidents for staff and learners was appropriate and whether informal processes also played a role. The college explained that all incidents start off informally and then, as appropriate, scale up to the formal process if required. The important thing the college wanted to express though, was that all racist incidents at the college would be treated seriously
- The panel questioned how quickly the college could implement improved reporting of incidents and the college responded by stating that the personal development programme for learners could be revised in two weeks to focus on any changes required

- The college stated that they were very keen to work collaboratively with other organisations in Torbay but especially those in the public sector, to have a joint approach to tackling racism and other aspects of equality and diversity. The college was particularly keen to learn from other organisations on how to improve reporting of incidents
- A member of the public suggested that the college look at using theatre to raise the issue of racism with their students and inspire conversation about it
- In response to a question from the panel the college stated that the council could help them on this issue by removing some of the barriers to BAME staff and learners moving to Torbay via improved housing, more jobs and making the culture and environment of Torbay more welcoming to people from a BAME background. They also wanted to collaborate more closely with the council as they recognise this is not just a college issue but is so across Torbay's organisations and institutions. The college was keen that a community wealth building approach was taken to tackling the issue.

Action – College to provide racist incident figures to panel

Action – College to share any adjustments made to personal development programme with panel